Tertiary Education for the Knowledge Society

VOLUME 1

SPECIAL FEATURES: GOVERNANCE, FUNDING, QUALITY

by

Paulo Santiago, Karine Tremblay, Ester Basri and Elena Arnal

OECD
## Table of contents

**Executive Summary** ................................................................. 13

1. **Introduction** ........................................................................... 23
   1.1 The growing focus on tertiary education ................................. 23
   1.2 Methodology ................................................................. 24
   1.3 Organisation of the report .................................................. 27

**References** ................................................................................. 28

2. **Setting the Steige: Impact, Trends and Challenges of Tertiary Education** ...................................................................... 29
   2.1 Introduction ........................................................................ 29
   2.2 The impact of tertiary education .......................................... 29
      2.2.1 Private benefits of tertiary education ........................... 29
      2.2.2 External (non-private) benefits of tertiary education ...... 36
      2.2.3 Social rates of return ................................................. 38
      2.2.4 Impact of tertiary education on economic growth .......... 39
   2.3 Trends and contextual developments in tertiary education ...... 41
      2.3.1 Trends in tertiary education ....................................... 41
      2.3.2 Contextual developments .......................................... 51
   2.4 Challenges in tertiary education .......................................... 57

**References** ................................................................................. 61

3. **Setting the Right Course: Steering Tertiary Education** .......... 67
   3.1 Introduction ........................................................................ 67
   3.2 Governance of tertiary education: concepts and dimensions ... 67
      3.2.1 The nature of governance Systems in tertiary education . 67
      3.2.2 The challenge of serving public interest ....................... 70
      3.2.3 The roles of the State ................................................ 71
      3.2.4 System design .......................................................... 75
      3.2.5 Level of institutional autonomy .................................. 80
      3.2.6 Market-type mechanisms in tertiary education ........... 83
      3.2.7 Accountability ......................................................... 89
   3.3 Steering TEIs: practices, trends, and drivers of change .......... 89
      3.3.1 Pattern one: reducing State control and widening institutional autonomy ........................................... 91
      3.3.2 Pattern two: from subsidy to steering ......................... 94
   3.4 Diversifying tertiary education Systems: practices, trends, and drivers of change ............................................. 96
      3.4.1 Pattern one: creating more vocationally-oriented institutions .......................................................... 97
      3.4.2 Pattern two: encouraging wider differentiation within a single institutional type through competition among institutions ........................................ 98
   3.5 System linkages .................................................................. 99
3.5.1 Linking tertiary education up and downstream with secondary education and working life ........................................ 99
3.5.2 Linkages with surrounding regions and communities .......................................................... 108
3.5.3 Linkages within the tertiary System .................................................................................... 116
3.6 Implications of System steering modes for institutional governance ........................................... 120
  3.6.1 Conceptual modes of institutional governance ................................................................. 121
  3.6.2 Enhanced institutional Strategic leadership within TEIs .................................................... 122
  3.6.3 Enhanced accountability to external stakeholders .............................................................. 129
3.7 Development of tertiary education policy .................................................................................. 132
  3.7.1 Policy design .................................................................................................................... 132
  3.7.2 Consultative processes and consensus building over tertiary education policy ................... 139
3.8 Pointers for future policy development .................................................................................... 143

References ......................................................................................................................................... 757

4. Matching Funding Strategies with National Priorities .................................................................. 163
  4.1 Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 163
  4.2 Trends in funding tertiary education ..................................................................................... 163
  4.3 Why do governments intervene in and subsidise tertiary education? ...................................... 168
    4.3.1 Efficiency concerns ........................................................................................................ 168
    4.3.2 Equity concerns ............................................................................................................. 170
    4.3.3 Other objectives ............................................................................................................ 171
  4.4 Why should students (or graduates) contribute to the costs of tertiary education? ................ 171
    4.4.1 Forms of and trends in cost-sharing in countries ............................................................. 171
    4.4.2 The case for cost-sharing .............................................................................................. 173
    4.4.3 Practical issues with and arguments against cost-sharing .............................................. 179
    4.4.4 Impact of cost-sharing .................................................................................................. 181
  4.5 Overall country approaches to funding tertiary education ..................................................... 185
  4.6 Tuition fees .......................................................................................................................... 189
  4.7 Allocation of public subsidies to institutions ............................................................................ 197
    4.7.1 Country mechanisms to allocate public subsidies to institutions .................................... 197
    4.7.2 Funding institutional infrastructure ............................................................................... 206
    4.7.3 Public funding of private institutions ............................................................................ 207
    4.7.4 Intermediate funding agencies ..................................................................................... 208
  4.8 External sources of institutional funding ................................................................................ 208
  4.9 Impact of funding approaches on institutional behaviour ..................................................... 210
  4.10 Funding for students ........................................................................................................... 213
    4.10.1 Overall strategies for assisting students ......................................................................... 213
    4.10.2 Non-repayable type of assistance ............................................................................... 218
    4.10.3 Repayable type of assistance ....................................................................................... 223
    4.10.4 Other support for students ......................................................................................... 232
    4.10.5 Impact of approaches to Student support ..................................................................... 233
  4.11 Efficiency of funds use ........................................................................................................ 235
    4.11.1 Inefficiencies in tertiary education Systems .................................................................. 236
    4.11.2 Analysing the cost-efficiency of institutions ................................................................. 238
    4.11.3 Determinants of institutional efficiency ......................................................................... 239
  4.12 Pointers for future policy development ............................................................................... 242

References ......................................................................................................................................... 257
5. **Assuring and Improving Quality** .................................................................................................................. 259

5.1 Introduction .................................................................................................................................................. 259

5.2 Definition and diversity of approaches ........................................................................................................ 259

5.2.1 What is quality assurance and why does it matter? .................................................................................. 259

5.2.2 Diversity of approaches to quality assurance .......................................................................................... 263

5.2.3 Ambivalence of purposes ......................................................................................................................... 264

5.3 Current practices in tertiary quality assurance Systems ................................................................................ 265

5.3.1 Approaches to quality assurance ........................................................................................................... 265

5.3.2 Key agencies and stakeholders involved in quality assurance .................................................................... 278

5.3.3 Methods and instruments .......................................................................................................................... 283

5.3.4 Outcomes .................................................................................................................................................. 288

5.4 Issues at stake and related policy challenges ................................................................................................ 292

5.4.1 Designing a framework that combines accountability and improvement function effectively .................. 292

5.4.2 Building consensus and trust among various stakeholders ....................................................................... 294

5.4.3 Enhancing the cost effectiveness of the quality assurance System ............................................................ 297

5.4.4 Addressing the implications of internationalisation for quality assurance .............................................. 303

5.4.5 Maximising the impact of the quality assurance system ........................................................................ 305

5.5 Pointers for future policy development ...................................................................................................... 309

**References** .................................................................................................................................................... 317

**Boxes**

Box 1.1. Definition of "tertiary education" .............................................................................................................. 25

Box 3.1. Mergers in the Russian Federation with the creation of National Universités ........................................... 80

Box 3.2. National students survey in the United Kingdom ................................................................................... 88

Box 3.3. National and public university incorporations in Japan .......................................................................... 92

Box 3.4. Contractualisation in universities in France .......................................................................................... 93

Box 3.5. Governance, steering and planning (investment planning) in New Zealand ............................................ 95

Box 3.6. Multiple facets of TEIs' regional engagement: Australia, Korea, Mexico, the Netherlands, Spain and the United Kingdom .................................................................................. 111

Box 3.7. Formal requirement for tertiary institutions' regional engagement in Finland ...................................... 114

Box 4.1. Targeted funding in Mexico and New Zealand .......................................................................................... 201

Box 4.2. Targeted funds for regional engagement in Korea .................................................................................. 210

Box 4.3. A comprehensive Student support system in Sweden ........................................................................... 217

Box 4.4. Income-contingent loans for domestic students in Australia .................................................................. 231

Box 5.1. The Joint accreditation Organisation of the Netherlands and Belgium (Flemish Community) ............. 275

Box 5.2. Assessments of tertiary education learning outcomes ............................................................................ 280

Box 5.3. Code of practice for the assurance of academic quality and Standards in the UK ................................. 285

Box 5.4. Dissemination of reports in Poland and the United Kingdom ................................................................. 289
Tables

Table 1. Main challenges in tertiary education .......................................................... 16
Table 2. Main Policy Directions ........................................................................... 17
Table 2.1. Key characteristics of Mode 1 and Mode 2 knowledge production ....... 54
Table 3.1. Governing boards in public tertiary education institutions, 2007 .......... 126
Table 4.1. Approaches to funding tertiary education, 2007 .................................. 185
Table 4.2. Tuition fees for domestic students in publicly-funded tertiary education institutions, 2007. ................................................................. 190
Table 4.3. Mechanisms to allocate public funds to tertiary education institutions for teaching and learning activities, 2007 .................................................. 198
Table 4.4. Approaches to Student support, 2007 ................................................... 213
Table 4.5. Student support: general grant schemes, 2007 ...................................... 220
Table 4.6. Student support: loan schemes, 2007 ....................................................... 226
Table 5.1 Typology of quality assurance approaches ............................................ 266
Table 5.2. Quality assurance of teaching and learning, 2007 ................................ 267
Table 5.3 Taxonomy of quality assurance approaches .......................................... 272
Table 5.4 Involvement in international cooperation on quality assurance, 2007 .... 304

Figures

Figure 2.1. Gross and net wage premia of tertiary graduates ............................... 31
Figure 2.2. Estimates of the Internal Rates of Return to Tertiary Education, 2001 .... 33
Figure 2.3. Change in the number of students in tertiary education between 1995 and 2004 ................................................................. 42
Figure 2.4. Net entry rates in tertiary-type A programmes, 1995-2005 ................ 43
Figure 2.5. Proportion of tertiary education students enrolled in independent private institutions ................................................................. 46
Figure 2.6. Difference between the percentage of females and the percentage of males who have attained at least tertiary education, by age group, 2005 ................................................................. 48
Figure 2.7. Ratio of the population aged 65 and over to the total population ......... 56
Figure 2.8. Expected demographic changes within the population aged 20-29 between 2006 and 2015 ................................................................. 56

Figure 3.1. Clark's triangle of co-ordination ............................................................ 68
Figure 3.2. Aspects of institutional autonomy .......................................................... 68

Figure 4.1. Annual expenditure on TEIs per Student, 2004 .................................... 164
Figure 4.2. Expenditure on TEIs as a percentage of GDP, 1995, 2000 and 2004 .......... 164
Figure 4.3. Change in expenditure per Student on TEIs between 1995 and 2004, public and private sources ................................................................. 165
Figure 4.4. Change in expenditure per Student on TEIs between 1995 and 2004, public sources only ................................................................. 165
Figure 4.5. Relative proportion of private expenditure on TEIs, 1995 and 2004 ........ 166
Figure 4.6. Relative proportion of private household expenditure on TEIs, 1995 and 2004 ................................................................. 166
Figure 4.7. Annual public expenditure per Student on TEIs relative to that on pre-tertiary institutions, 1995 and 2004 ................................................................. 175
Figure 4.8. Public expenditure on education as a percentage of total public expenditure ................................................................. 176
Figure 4.9. New tertiary female graduates as a share of the 20-29 female population and relative proportion of private expenditure on TEIs, 2004 ................................................................. 187
Figure 4.10. Average annual tuition fees charged by tertiary-type A public institutions for full-time national students, in USD converted using PPPs (academic year 2004/2005) ........ 196
Figure 4.11. Relative proportion of expenditure by private entities other than households on TEIs, 1995 and 2004.................................................................209
Figure 4.12. Public subsidies for financial aid to students as a percentage of total public expenditure on tertiary education, 2004.................................................................214
Figure 4.13. Public subsidies for financial aid to students as a percentage of total public expenditure on tertiary education, 1998.................................................................215
Figure 4.14. Costs of education relative to available individual funding, 2006.................................216
Figure 4.15. Proportion of loan-based aid among public subsidies for financial aid to students in tertiary education, 1998 and 2004.................................................................224