Rules, Games, and Common-Pool Resources

Elinor Ostrom, Roy Gardner, and James Walker

with
Arun Agrawal, William Blomquist, Edella Schlager, and Shui Yan Tang

Ann Arbor

The University of Michigan Press
Contents

Tables xiii
Figures xv

Part 1. Theoretical Background

Chapter 1. Rules, Games, and Common-Pool Resource Problems 3
Common-Pool Resource Problems
Conceptual Foundations and Key Terms
Classifying CPR Situations: Appropriation and Provision
CPR Situations and CPR Dilemmas
Coordinated Strategies to Resolve CPR Dilemmas
The Central Questions to Be Addressed
The Plan for This Book

Chapter 2. Institutional Analysis and Common-Pool Resources 23
Models, Theories, and Frameworks
Historical Roots of IAD
The Institutional Analysis and Development Framework
The Action Situation
Actors
Factors Affecting Action Arenas
Linking Action Arenas
Multiple Levels of Analysis
Multiple Levels of Analysis and Solving Higher-Order Dilemmas
Conclusions

Chapter 3. Games Appropriators Play 51
The Use of Formal Models
CPR Games with Two Players and Two Strategies
Repeated CPR Games
Conclusions

Chapter 4. Rules and Games 75
How Rules Affect the Structure of a Game
Contents

Some Empirical Examples of Changes in Authority Rules
Fishing Rules and Fishing Games
Outcome Comparison
Conclusions

Part 2. Experimental Studies

Chapter 5. CPR Baseline Appropriation Experiments 105
CPR Appropriation
Appropriation Behavior in the Laboratory
Conclusions
Appendix 5.1.: CPR Provision Problems
Zero Provision Environments and a Simple Contribution Mechanism
Discrete Public Goods and VCM
Discrete Public Goods and Alternative Contribution Mechanisms
Appendix 5.2.: Experimental Numbers
Appendix 5.3.: Market 2 Group Investment Decisions

Chapter 6. Probabilistic Destruction of the CPR 129
Model of a Destructible CPR
Finite Deterministic Repetition of the Constituent Game
The Experimental Design
Experimental Results
Conclusions
Appendix 6.1.: Across Period Behavior: Tokens Invested in Market 2

Chapter 7. Communication in the Commons 145
Communication: Theoretical Issues
One-Shot Costless Communication
Repeated Costless Communication
Costly Communication
Conclusions

Chapter 8. Sanctioning and Communication Institutions 171
Sanctioning in the Constituent Game
The Experimental Setting and Results
Conclusions

Chapter 9. Regularities from the Laboratory and Possible Explanations 195
Why So Much Cooperation in Communication Experiments?
Conclusions
Part 3. Field Studies

Chapter 10. Institutions and Performance in Irrigation Systems 225
by Shui Yan Tang
Comparing Irrigation Systems
Performance Measures and Linkages among Action Arenas
Matching Rules to Physical Domains
Multiple Levels of Institutional Arrangements
Monitoring and Enforcement Arrangements
Conclusions
Appendix 10.1.: Case Profiles

Chapter 11. Fishers' Institutional Responses to Common-Pool Resource Dilemmas 247
by Edella Schlager
Coastal Fisheries as Common-Pool Resource Dilemmas
CPR Dilemmas, Complexity, and Coastal Fisheries
Fishers' Responses to CPR Dilemmas
Commons Dilemmas and Organized Fishers
Performance of Fishers' Organizations
Conclusions

Chapter 12. Rules, Rule Making, and Rule Breaking: Examining the Fit between Rule Systems and Resource Use 267
by Arun Agrawal
The Historical Context
The Local Context
Authority Rules Related to Allocation
Monitoring
Sanctioning
Arbitration
Conclusions

by William Blomquist
Groundwater Basins as Common-Pool Resources
The Levels of Action
Linked Action Arenas
Operational-Level Rule Configurations
Operational-Level Rules and Game Structure
Contents

Rules, Actions, and Outcomes: Evidence from the Cases
Conclusions

Chapter 14. Regularities from the Field and Possible Explanations
by William Blomquist, Edella Schlager, Shui Yan Tang, and Elinor Ostrom
Commonalities across Organized CPRs
Differences across Organized CPRs
Physical Characteristics That Make a Difference
Conclusions

Part 4. Conclusion

Chapter 15. Cooperation and Social Capital
Theoretical Choices in Doing Policy Analysis
Surmounting CPR Dilemmas

Bibliography
Contributors
Index